

1 **PROVIDENCE CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES**

2 **April 12, 2016 6:00 p.m.**

3 **Providence Elementary School**

4 **91 East Center, Providence UT**

5  
6 Call to Order: Mayor Calderwood

7 Roll Call of City Council Members: Mayor Calderwood

8 Attendance: Kirk Allen, Jeff Baldwin, John Drew, Dennis Giles, Roy Sneddon

9 Pledge of Allegiance: Mayor Calderwood

10  
11 **Approval of the minutes**

12 **Item No. 1.** The Providence City Council will consider approval of the minutes of March 29, 2016 City Council meeting.

13  
14 **Motion to approve the minutes with the following corrections: K Allen, second – R Sneddon**

15 **Vote: Yea: K Allen, J Baldwin, J Drew, D Giles, R Sneddon**

16 **Nay: None**

17 **Abstained: None**

18 **Excused: None**

19 **Public Comments:** Citizens may appear before the City Council to express their views on issues within the City's jurisdiction. Comments will be addressed to the Council. Remarks are limited to 3 minutes per person. The total time allotted to public comment is 15 minutes. The City Council may act on an item, if it arose subsequent to the posting of this agenda and the City Council determines that an emergency exists.

- 23 • Dan Turner, resident, commented that since last September a lot has happened in the city. He feels there is a lot of unrest among the citizens and no answers for the public. What is being done to report back to the citizens that may affect city as a whole?
- 24 • J Baldwin said a lot of things discussed have been done in exec session and cannot be discussed outside those sessions; however, it is fair to say the council has been actively trying to resolve the issues.
- 25 • D Turner asked if there was a timeline for a resolution.
- 26 • J Baldwin said he feels like the issues have been addressed and the council is moving forward. Some citizens feel there is reason for change in our city government, but switching to a different form of government will have complications.
- 27 • K Allen said some things cannot be discussed publicly to protect the rights of people involved. Council has been diligent in resolving the issues and striving to move forward. The city newsletter goes out monthly and the Mayor tries to keep the public informed on the issues.
- 28 • R Sneddon said he has a handout for later in the meeting that shows comparisons for the organizational structure of other cities similar in size to Providence. It should be informative.
- 29 • J Drew also has specific comments for the public hearing later in the meeting.
- 30 • D Giles said he agrees with what J Baldwin has said.
- 31 • D Turner said he wasn't asking about the government structure, but as he has been in discussed with neighbors, some of them are embarrassed about articles that have been in the paper.
- 32 • Chad Checketts back in September nepotism was an issue. It is still an issue. What is the council doing to resolve that issue?
- 33 • Mayor said nepotism is addressed by state code. If there are relatives working in the city organization, state code says if one relative does not report to the other relative, nepotism is not being practiced. If one relative has not influenced a monetary increase for the other relative, nepotism is not being practiced. This city does not practice nepotism, even though we have two closely related employees.
- 34 • Monti Jones commented on the all-male council. Commented that many years ago when her husband was on council and she was on planning commission, they saw a need for new city office. She thinks the city needs a new building. Lions club and senior citizens would have a place to meet. Perhaps the new building could be used for a senior citizens center. Since she pays her bill on line and has not had paper newsletter for a long time, she would like to see it online.
- 35 • Mayor commented that newsletter is online. The new building will have an area the senior citizens can use.

- K Allen encouraged females to run for city office. He said there was an excellent female candidate running for city council last election, but she was not elected.
- Sherry Ward asked who the human resources director was, who is currently in charge of hiring and who has been in charge of hiring in the past.
- Mayor said the city has a human resources professional that is consulted, as well as an attorney. The city has 3-4 individuals that confirm HR decisions. Tara Bankhead was appointed as the human resources representative, she was appointed by Mayor Liechty. She currently reports directly to Mayor Calderwood.

Public hearing closed at 6:20 pm.

**Public Hearing:**

**Item No. 1. 6:15 p.m. Proposed Annexation:** The Providence City Council is holding a public hearing to provide an opportunity for anyone interested to comment on a proposed annexation, 1.41 acres more or less, commonly known as approximately 700 West 300 South (a portion of Parcels No. 02-090-0018 AND 02-090-0011); sponsored by Mark A. Anderson, Managing Partner M&R LLC.

- S Bankhead said explained why this property is being proposed for annexation. When Jerry Fickas was the owner, he annexed the to the property line. He subsequently purchased this other strip of land to the west and then sold the business and property to Mark Anderson. Mark Anderson would like all his property annexed into Providence. The north half is zoned CGD and the south is zoned ARG zoning. The proposal needs to be amended to reflect this zoning.

Public hearing closed w/o comment at 6:25 pm.

**Business Items:**

**Item No. 1. Resolution 015-2016:** The Providence City Council will consider for adoption a resolution appointing Rowan Cecil as an alternate member on the Providence City Planning Commission.

**Motion to adopt Resolution 015-2016 appointing Rowan Cecil as a member of the Planning Commission: J Baldwin, second – R Sneddon**

- J Baldwin supports this appointment.
- K Allen appreciated how informed R Cecil was when he served previously on Planning Commission. He felt R Cecil would be an asset to the Planning Commission.
- R Sneddon commented that R Cecil was trained as a petroleum engineer, but his career morphed into hydraulics, just so the public understands his background. Water is an issue and the city needs to stay ahead of the issue. Cecil's expertise will be a benefit to Providence City and Planning Commission.
- J Drew commented that at the last council meeting R Cecil talked about rezoning AGR property to multi-family and R Cecil was against it because he lives close to the area being considered for rezone. J Drew asked what the master plan says about that parcel.
- S Bankhead said the existing 2000 plan said it would be one of the single family zones. Four years ago when planning commission was working on the general plan, they looked at mixed use in that area. A portion of the Amsource property was changed to mixed use. Planning Commission will be discussing it tomorrow. She thinks it is currently zoned residential, density level 10,000. J Drew asked Rowan if he would recuse himself if there were a conflict of interest.
- R Cecil said he would give his opinion, but would recuse himself on the vote.

**Vote: Yea: K Allen, J Baldwin, J Drew, D Giles, R Sneddon**

**Nay: None**

**Abstained: None**

**Excused: None**

**Item No. 2. Discussion – Cache County Trails:** Dayton Crites, Cache County Trails Planning, will discuss the role of the Cache County Trail Planning and the services they offer.

- Dayton Crites, Cache County Trails Planner, addressed the council and audience. He is a newly appointed Cache County Trails planner. He feels trails should be considered as infrastructure. There is a master plan for roadways, waterways, etc.; all done for health and safety of the community, and to build the economy. Trails should also have a master plan. Canyon trails throughout the community should be linked. Trails in community provide safe routes for children to go to school. Studies have shown that in Cache Valley when homes have a proximity to trails, those home values increase. He is here to help facilitate funding, legal aspects and development of trail plans.
- J Drew asked if his responsibility ends at the city limits.

- D Crites said he works with all communities in Cache Valley in an effort to get all communities to work together to improve the trail system in Cache Valley.
- J Drew asked if his term is two years.
- D Crites said it is a preliminary two years with the intent of extending the contract.
- J Baldwin asked if there was a county master plan for trails.
- D Crites said there is not. The closest thing is the CNPO plan. This fall he will be working with River Trails Conservation Alliance to get a natural trails plan established.
- K Allen commented that Logan has a good trail system. Are cities willing to work together to make trails cross boundaries?
- D Crites said absolutely he is going to help municipalities work together to extend trails throughout all communities.

**Item No. 3. Annexation Ordinance No. 2016-006:** The Providence City Council will consider for adoption an ordinance annexing 1.41 acres more or less, commonly known as approximately 700 West 300 South, sponsored by Mark A. Anderson, Managing Partner M&R LLC. The proposed zone for the property is commercial general district.

**Motion to approve annexation Ordinance No. 2016-006 and amend the north half to be zoned CGD and the south half to be zoned AGR: J Baldwin, second – D Giles**

**Vote:**    **Yea:**                    K Allen, J Baldwin, J Drew, D Giles, R Sneddon  
               **Nay:**                    None  
               **Abstained:**        None  
               **Excused:**            None

**Item No. 4. Rezone Ordinance No. 2016-007:** The Providence City Council will consider for adoption an ordinance rezoning Parcels No. 02-0096-0001 and 02-096-0049, generally located at 485 West 100 South and 450 West 100 South, from Agricultural (AGR) to Multi Family High Density (MFH).

- This item was pulled from the agenda.

**Public Hearing:**

**Item No. 2. 6:30 p.m. Proposed Code Amendment:** The Providence City Council is holding a public hearing to provide an opportunity for anyone interested to comment on a proposed ordinance providing that a City Manager will serve as the chief administrative officer of the City and report directly to the Council. This ordinance would remove a power that is provided for a as the Mayor's duty under Utah Code Ann. 10-3b-104.

- Bob Bissland stated 10 reasons Providence should not change current form of government:
  1. Such a change will cost considerable expense to taxpayer. A competent, experienced city manager will cost about \$75,000/year plus benefits.
  2. There will be additional hiring and resignations which will cost more money and needless disruption of city.
  3. This will decrease ease of access for citizens to city government by adding more bureaucracy.
  4. A non-resident, non-elected city manager will pose a higher risk of graft and corruption; i.e., a return to the "good ole boy" system.
  5. Our Mayor has 22 years of professional background in human engineering and production engineering. No city manager is likely to do as well in this challenging job.
  6. The mayor is elected. Citizens have the ability to replace him directly when they want a change.
  7. Changing governing model in the middle of this mayor's term is a disservice to many residents in Providence who elected him to do the job that he is doing.
  8. The present mayor is doing the job that a city manager would do at about a quarter of the cost. He is working full time and is working with the wisdom and business acumen of many years of experience. He abides by the law.
  9. Sponsors of the change have failed to give a single good reason why they favor this change. It makes one wonder why their personal motivation might be.
  10. Sponsors claim that because other cities have a city manager, so should Providence. They have a different set of management problems. They have their own police departments, golf course and fire departments that require more oversight.
- Alma Leonhardt said that in his three terms there were always one or two women on the Council or Planning Commission. Hyrum does not have a council manager; they have and always have had a city

1 administrator, also North Logan. Their cities are run very well with that system. He has spent over 12  
2 years in meetings with city managers, they can be very direct; they control the city and can be worse than  
3 a city administrator.

- 4 • Bill Bertolio resident of Providence for 50 years. He loves the city and loves the way it has been run. He  
5 appreciates the job Skarlet Bankhead has done in running the city.
- 6 • Ross Brown, resident of Providence, does not support the council manager form of government. Most  
7 arguments are that there needs to be more transparency and greater communications. Neither of these  
8 issues will be addressed by a city manager. City Council and Mayor's office can manage both. In regards to  
9 the opposition of the purchase of new city building, a new city manager will not fix that issue. It is a done  
10 deal.
- 11 • Laura Fisher stated that she has the printed list of the 10 reasons against the city manager model that Bob  
12 Bissland read.
- 13 • Meredith Bitter, citizen of Providence, favors the city manager petition. He thinks it is healthy to consider  
14 the options and would like to hear more dialogue regarding city managers as it will be a great opportunity  
15 to be educated over the next few months. He is not part of either faction but would like to look at the  
16 options and see if the proposed change withstands the scrutiny.
- 17 • Stan Checketts thanked the council for their time and service. He encouraged the council to make sure all  
18 citizens' opinions are considered properly. Citizens need to be more engaged, weigh the options.  
19 Disappointed more citizens aren't here. More should participate and less should criticize. The issues need  
20 to be studied.
- 21 • Ron Smith, citizen of Providence for 14 years. He feels a strong compelling case has not been made as to  
22 why Providence needs a city manager. He has heard grievances, but not any strong arguments. This is a  
23 costly change. He is ready to stand in opposition even if a compelling case is made. He supports current  
24 form of city government.
- 25 • Brian Cox feels the city administrator has too much on her plate. The city has grown and so have the  
26 problems. Attorneys at city council meetings, HR issues and government issues need to be addressed. He  
27 did not support the last city manager, but feels it is time to consider that option as long as it is an  
28 experienced and trained city manager.
- 29 • Ralph Daniels, citizen of Providence, has contacted cities that have city managers to answer questions he  
30 has. He thinks at some time a city manager would be good for Providence, but not now. 1. Ordinance  
31 change has been proposed for the wrong reasons. 2. Ordinance change has been proposed w/o research  
32 as to cost, why we need it and how it will be paid for. The whole thing is proposed to get rid of the power  
33 of the mayor. Read the proposed ordinance, pointing out all the reason he felt it was unnecessary to  
34 change form of government, including mayoral powers, cost of hiring a city manager, hiring a city  
35 manager just because other cities have city managers, etc. He feels there is consistency in the city  
36 because a mayor is elected for four years. He believes in the separation of powers that currently exist in  
37 the city. He feels the new ordinance will change that and does not want all power centralized.
- 38 • Chad Checketts said most of the reason this initiative is proposed is to give citizens a choice. Nobody has  
39 specific answers or solutions at this point, but as things move forward solutions will come. City manager  
40 may not cost more as a city manager can operate in a variety of different ways. He favors a city manager  
41 so that one person is not always making the decisions for the city. A quorum of like-minded people should  
42 be making those decisions. A mayor has the power to appoint people to key positions. A city manager  
43 answers to the council. Mayor serves for four years, but when the mayor is gone, the citizens will live with  
44 the decisions of that Mayor for many years after. In a city manager form of government, the mayor only  
45 has one vote as part of the council. There is a separation of power. Currently the mayor has legislative and  
46 administrative powers. He encouraged the residents to put biases aside and get educated and decide  
47 what is needed. He invited the mayor to sign the ballot.
- 48 • Mayor Calderwood clarified that he does not appoint people to key positions unless the council approves  
49 it. As to the building, he invited Bill Bagley to clarify the issue.
- 50 • Bill Bagley, former councilman, said he would be happy to talk to anyone who wanted to talk to him and  
51 clarify any falsehoods, rumors and general misinformation from a few weeks ago. There is spinning as to  
52 how the vote for the building took place. He has minutes, agendas and the chronology for that meeting.  
53 On May 12, 2015 an agenda motion was made, in a public meeting, and there was discussion to move



1 funds to purchase building. Budget had to be turned into the State of Utah by end of June 2015. There has  
2 been no tax increase for that new building. Even though that was predicted, it turned out to be a  
3 falsehood. June 9, 2015, a public meeting was held and the purpose of that meeting was to sign the  
4 purchase contract. There was a 3/2 vote to move ahead. Councilman John Russell was on vacation in  
5 Alaska, which made the vote 2/2 with the mayor making the deciding vote. As far as the misinformation  
6 that the purchase of this building will cost well over a 1.3M, that is a falsehood. The cost of the building  
7 was \$1,075,000. \$102,800 was proposed for renovations and move-in costs. There are not secrets, this is  
8 public information. The check was written and it did not affect the road budget or taxes.

- 9 • He asked mayor to review what will be done this year and what was done last year without increased  
10 appropriations. The building is done and over with, it is time to get on with city business.
- 11 • Steve Jenson asked if the councilman that was on vacation had asked for the vote to be delayed. With  
12 such an expensive purchase it would have been important for all council members to vote on the  
13 decision.
- 14 • B Bagley said he did not because the budget had to be turned in the end of June 2015. This had been on  
15 the agenda for two or three meetings before that. The city had to move on with the decision.
- 16 • Steve Jenson grew up in Providence, and supports the city manager proposal. Does not feel we have a  
17 long term plan on how to improve infrastructure in the city. It seems to change with each Mayor. He feels  
18 the city has worst roads in Cache Valley. Millville spends about \$300,000/year on roads and they don't  
19 have any potholes. Citizens should be vocal about demanding a long term plan. Every year there is a walk  
20 to school day for the kids. His kids have to take a bus to Von's Park to walk to school because Canyon  
21 Road is so unsafe. Road improvement should be considered before we make the most expensive purchase  
22 in city history. If we are going to make a purchase on such an expensive building, how hard is it to take a  
23 survey so the entire city can vote?
- 24 • Dan Turner said professionally he has dealt with the city numerous times. He feels the mayor and city  
25 administrator are doing the best job they can. Would someone else do it better or differently? He does  
26 not know, but that is why it should be on the ballot. There are two sides to this issue. Being an American  
27 is founded on being able to make decisions and govern ourselves. He wants people to sign the petition so  
28 it can be on the ballot, then people can become informed and make informed decisions.
- 29 • Brent Speth, resident of Providence, said two weeks ago this was an ordinance before the city to be  
30 adopted by city council without public hearing. Those who opposed this proposal felt it would be a wise  
31 decision to have this public hearing and let the citizens voice their opinions. Everyone should have a  
32 chance to voice their opinion and learn what a city manager should be and could be and then make a wise  
33 decision. He would like to see the credentials of the prospective city managers, but that credential  
34 selection will be left up to the city council. It will be their responsibility to select a new city manager. It  
35 happened before and the council made a poor choice and the residents still live with the choices of that  
36 council. Asked about the sales tax from Macey's.
- 37 • S Bankhead said that is proprietary information.
- 38 • B Bagley said \$65-85 thousand per month goes into the city, as sales tax, that includes Macey's.
- 39 • B Speth felt we needed more tax revenue before can we pay for a city manager. You have to consider the  
40 budget and benefits/costs ratio. The current city administrator is also the city recorder, she will still be on  
41 staff, the mayor isn't going away, so adding a new city manager will increase costs. No way to get around  
42 that.
- 43 • Christy Painter, resident of Providence. Lots of mayors come and go. Providence has had poor education  
44 as to how to get involved. Many residents don't realize they don't have a say in what happens, they are  
45 unaware that city council answers to citizens. Why pay someone else to run something when a lot of  
46 power the city manager has could be turned over to mayor? As a third option, the responsibilities of the  
47 Mayor and a city manager could be combined. We need better attendance at city council meetings and  
48 information needs to be more available.
- 49 • Richard Eames commented that getting 90% of the citizens to vote would be difficult as 90 % of the  
50 residents don't even come to city council meetings. If people have complaints about the roads, they need  
51 to visit with the mayor or come to the city council meetings and voice their concerns. He supports the  
52 mayor and council form of government.
- 53 • Cindy Litchford, resident of Providence. She is new to the valley and loves living in Providence. She feels

the issue tonight seems to be based on emotion and character attacks. Comparing Providence to North Logan, which has a budget of \$9M is not fair. To say we need a city manager because someone else has one is not a valid point. Hears mostly from neighbors and others is a lack of accountability. Whether it is a city manager or mayor in charge, someone has to be made accountable for the decisions that are made. That seems to be what is lacking in Providence City. As to the budget no line items for attorney fees, engineer fees, etc. Recorder makes \$91,600/year but no line item in budget for that salary. Is there an audit done every year, and is it an outside audit? Does the city have a city accountant or city controller, or is someone just putting the data into QuickBooks?

- J Drew said the city has financial audits that are outsourced, but the scope is limited in what they do. They assure money is segregated and set aside according to state code. That does not mean the city is effective or efficient. This simply means the audit meets accounting standard requirements for financial statements.
- C Richards asked if the auditors take samplings and if the audit is thorough. She encouraged the city council to be more transparent and more willing to accept responsibility when complaints are raised.
- J Drew said samples are taken and there are checks and balances. The city operates under separation of duties, but as a small city, many of the responsibilities overlap, but the controls are there. By the way, the terms city manager and city administrator are interchangeable in the State of Utah. They are defined by responsibilities given by each city ordinance.
- S Bankhead said the invoice register and financial statements are given to the council every month. The city does have line items for attorneys for land use, administration and water. Also, there is a line item for city engineer as well.
- Rowan Cecil said the reasons some people haven't signed the petition it is because residents don't want the expense of the election. Asked, by show of hands, how many were at the last two city council meetings. Those who haven't attended don't know what is going on. Mayor is not a tyrant. Every ordinance and resolution has to be voted upon by the council. If the city council votes no, that vote stands, the mayor cannot reverse that decision. The city council has more authority than what we've been lead to believe. He has consistently attended city council meetings. He has been the chairman of the planning commission. Mr. Bill Bagley served well on city council. He was meticulous about the financial status of the city. R Cecil has lived here 8 years, he likes living here. After working on the planning commission he does not feel we need a city manager.
- Ross Brown asked if there were any long range plans for infrastructure in Providence. How do citizens gain access to that plan?
- Mayor said he could come to city council and get it on the agenda for discussion.
- R Sneddon passed around a city government cost and function analysis for 14 Utah Cities. He reviewed the handout.
- Mayor clarified this is just for a city manager position, not all other employees.
- Chad Checketts and Ryan Stolworthy asked for clarification on some of the numbers and the 38% benefits.
- R Sneddon answered those questions and clarified for the audience.
- K Allen commented that the Utah Retirement System, state and federal tax, insurance, social security, and health benefits add up to about 34-38%. Benefits shatter budgets.
- J Drew mentioned that he went out of his way to find people who disagreed with him on this idea. He went out to collect signatures to see what people had to say who didn't know him. Only one person said no to sign the petition. Citizens have questions and concerns about the status of the city. He answered a lot of questions for these citizens. He has lived here 10 years, knows a lot of people. City has doubled in size in the last 15 years. When people talk about Providence City government, there has been controversy as long as he's lived here. People need to be educated by policy experts who work with government agencies. Tansparent.utah.gov has more current information that what R Sneddon handed out tonight, which is 2014 salary information. He has spoken with many city managers about their role and experiences as city manager. He heard many of the same concerns from them that Providence City is facing. Everything does not get fixed with a city manager. David Church, who is the general counsel for Utah League of Cities and Towns, has said that city managers run a more efficient form of government and more cost effective. City council is the governing body and delegates duties to the Mayor. Past elections were about voting for mayor and city council members, not what form of government

1 Providence has. City manager will not necessarily cost \$120,000/year. There are options available that will  
2 cost much less.

- 3 • K Allen commented that he appreciates those who have put work into this and those who have come to  
4 give input. This is not complicated. There are pros and cons for city manager and for the mayoral form of  
5 government. Providence is a great city. If this city is so poorly run, why are people moving here all the  
6 time? Why are the ball parks open and running late at night? Why do people want to be buried in  
7 Providence City Cemetery? Why does Providence have the highest property values in the valley?  
8 Providence has been well managed and well served by past councils and mayors. These are not easy jobs.  
9 We've had great mayors who have served us well. People who work for the city want to work for the city.  
10 He does not want to abandon the mayoral form of government right now. Professionals may not be  
11 willing to leave lucrative professions to come to Providence and be a city manager. He hopes for an  
12 educated vote by the public. He would like to make sure the voice of the people is heard.
- 13 • J Baldwin agreed with K Allen, this needs to be an educated vote. He is not on one side or the other. The  
14 issue is city manager or mayor form of government like we have now. He has confidence in the integrity  
15 of individuals currently running the city. He does not feel there has been a good reason presented to  
16 switch from one form of government to another. A mayor or a city manager can ruin the city if they  
17 serve/work without integrity. There is a definite financial aspect to this as the city will be hiring another  
18 employee. Do the citizens want to go to that expense? How does one find out about a master plan for the  
19 city? Go to the city council or planning commission meetings. There is a master plan for roads and just  
20 about every facet of the city. Generally the planning commission meeting is pretty empty, as well as city  
21 council meeting. Individuals are responsible for knowing what is going on in the city. Nobody in the city  
22 council or the city office will refuse to help someone get information that is requested. On accountability,  
23 the city has gone through some struggles in the last 6 months. City council made decisions that were well  
24 within the law. Legal advice was sought, as it should have been. Engineers are hired by the city to oversee  
25 the city projects. Hiring a city manager that is a licensed engineer will not get us out of hiring other  
26 professional engineers. Whether we have a city manager or mayoral form of government, no one person  
27 should have absolute say over what happens in the city. Council has been very responsive to the citizens  
28 when it comes to addressing issues that come up. Road repairs are very costly. Not everybody in  
29 Providence is going to get a brand new road. Providence does not have the worst roads in the community.  
30 If anyone wants to understand the definition of nepotism, go to Utah code and read it for their selves;  
31 then decide if the city is in violation of that code. The council has worked for a long period of time to try  
32 and resolve issues that have been a concern. Changing to a city manager may have some benefits, but it  
33 will not make all problems in Providence go away.
- 34 • D Giles thanked audience members for coming out. He helped get petitions signed. His son is a city  
35 manager for Smithfield City and he answers to the city council. He will evaluate the information he has  
36 and make a decision.
- 37 • Mayor said this year \$800,000 has been budgeted for roads with council approval. Furhriman Drive, 300  
38 East and all three blocks of 400 South will be taken care of. One million square feet of blacktop will go on  
39 roads this year, about 20-25 streets. In addition, the city has received \$1.23M from the county to extend  
40 Gateway Drive. On 400 South, council approved 29 feet of asphalt will go down and another \$300,000 will  
41 be requested from the council for that street. Council makes these decisions. He is responsible for city  
42 staff.
- 43 • Jonathan Kay, audience member asked if more road work was done because oil prices were down.
- 44 • Mayor said it had been scheduled for last year, but it didn't get done. S Bankhead said yes, oil prices made  
45 a difference.
- 46 • There was a question from an audience member about rushing to purchase the building in order to meet  
47 a budget deadline and why the meeting wasn't cancelled so that all council members could be in  
48 attendance.
- 49 • S Bankhead said there was a budget adjustment in May from funds that had been received in prior years  
50 and that hadn't been spent. Then the 2015 budget was adjusted and in order to spend that money, it had  
51 to be spent before June 30 or there would have been another budget adjustment. Money had been  
52 allocated in the 2015 budget and it had to be spent before June 30, 2015.

53 **Motion to adjourn meeting at Providence Elementary and resume at Providence City Office Building: J Baldwin,**

1 second – D Giles

2 **Vote:** Yea: K Allen, J Baldwin, J Drew, D Giles, R Sneddon

3 Nay: None

4 Abstained: None

5 Excused: None

6 There was a short recess at 9:00 pm and the city council meeting continued at the Providence City Office Building  
7 at 9:10 pm..

8 **Staff Reports:** Items presented by Providence City Staff will be presented as information only.

9 R Stapley:

- 10 • K Allen asked about the Ha5 seal. He is seeing cracks in some roads that have the treatment. Is the Ha5  
11 supposed to be flexible?
- 12 • R Stapley said the problems are because of high density use in Providence, sinking of roads and water  
13 damage. He is still going through the selection process deciding which roads will receive Ha-5 application,  
14 which roads will receive a different application, and which roads are dead and need to have a new overlay  
15 or be rebuilt. In about two weeks there will be a pre-comb on the million sf of road that will get new  
16 asphalt. Crack seal crew will be here by end of April.
- 17 • Divers are scheduled to be here to clean reservoirs May 5.
- 18 • Bids are coming in from two different companies for quotes for cleaning the sewers. Rob will start an  
19 annual routine of systematic cleaning of the collection system.
- 20 • Collection boxes and drop boxes for storm water are being cleaned. There is a lot of silt and that builds  
21 over the year.
- 22 • Parks – busy with soccer, baseball, softball. All restrooms are open.
- 23 • R Sneddon asked if the road aggregate and minerals in the rock on the roads will make a difference in the  
24 life of the Ha5.
- 25 • J Baldwin said he hasn't seen any reaction on the roads between the Ha5 and the asphalt.
- 26 • R Stapley said he really likes the Ha5 product. It is a good product. If the pavement is clean and in good  
27 condition, the Ha5 is one of the best treatments that can go down, if the road isn't in good condition,  
28 another type of treatment has to go down.
- 29 • S Bankhead said we put this on new roads for longevity, so people get frustrated that new roads are being  
30 treated when the road in front of their home is completely falling apart.
- 31 • R Stapley said the earlier some of these applications go down, the longer the road will last.
- 32 • K Allen felt 95% of the bumps are from old sewer lines. R Stapley agreed.

33 Skarlet Bankhead:

- 34 • Financial report was given to the council. Invoice register is in the report. The council may call or email for  
35 questions or concerns.

36 **Council Reports:** Items presented by the City Council members will be presented as informational only; no formal  
37 action will be taken. The City Council may act on an item, if it arose subsequent to the posting of this agenda and  
38 the City Council determines that an emergency exists.

- 39 • D Giles – no report.
- 40 • J Drew attended planning and zoning. It was a full room with Danny Macfarlane, Stan Checketts and  
41 audience members. Everyone left pleased. Dayton Crites explained what the newly proposed trail will be  
42 like. It will be moved to follow the ancient Bonneville Lake Shoreline. It will be less trail maintenance, less  
43 slope and less erosion. It was well received. The roadway will open the land for development. Challenge is  
44 infrastructure issues. Stan Checketts will donate land for the reservoir. Chad Checketts said he will also  
45 donate land.
- 46 • R Sneddon - no report.
- 47 • K Allen said the slope in the Little Baldy subdivision will have to be watched as subsequent development  
48 comes in. He felt the meeting at the school was a great meeting. He appreciates the work of R Sneddon  
49 and J Drew to get information to the citizens and the council. He feels the city has been well run, but that  
50 does not mean it cannot be run better. Codes need to be addressed.
- 51 • J Drew felt there were plenty of challenges ahead with all the growth coming to Providence.
- 52 • J Baldwin felt the meeting was informative.



- Mayor Calderwood said Stan's preliminary plan road will open lots for building. That will be a challenge for water. Currently we are okay and do not need another reservoir, but with the coming development it will need to be addressed. The apartment complex on Gateway and Stan's 38 homes will not impact water.
- J Drew asked about the impact study.
- S Bankhead said Max Pierce has put some numbers together, still waiting for more information. RFP will need to go out for impact study and then they can go forward. They need a definite engineering plan before the RFP can be done. Rob, Tara and Skarlet are going to a conference on water rights put on by Rural Water and Division of Water Quality. Next week she will attend a Government Finance Officers meeting in St. George. She will try to have the report by the first meeting in May so it can be discussed as part of the budget.
- R Sneddon asked if there are any water rights the city can purchase for the summer.
- S Bankhead said she isn't aware of anyone selling rights in the Providence area. It is quite a process to get the State engineer to transfer that water and get it changed to municipal use. There are people willing to sell in Spring Creek and Blacksmith Fork, but we have a cap for purchase of water shares, so people are able to sell shares at a higher rate on the open market. We would have to be more competitive on the purchase price if we want to start purchasing water shares.
- R Sneddon said he is asking because of water usage in summer.
- R Stapley said our winter right is abundant and we have to make sure we can use those water rights (prove beneficial uses). The reservoir is just where it needs to be to start discussion and the planning process. We have a lot more winter rights than we will ever need.
- R Sneddon said if Stan Checketts could use irrigation water on those estates, we buy time for wells for culinary water.
- R Stapley said staff is studying the feasibility of moving water into the new subdivision. Moving water is always a concern. Rob felt Stan didn't want to be involved in secondary water for his subdivision.
- Mayor recommended R Sneddon visit with the Spring Creek Water Board. There are no laterals up in that subdivision.
- J Drew said the city is in good shape as far as water rights go. We probably would not buy water rights; it's not necessary.

**Executive Session Notice:**

**The Executive Sessions, if held, will be held at the Providence City Office Building, 15 South Main, Providence UT**

The Providence City Council may enter into a closed session to discuss pending or reasonably imminent litigation as allowed by Utah Code 52-4-205(1)(c).

The Providence City Council may enter into a closed session to discuss professional competence or other factors allowed by Utah Code 52-4-205(1)(a).

The Providence City Council may enter into a closed session to discuss land acquisition or the sale of real property Utah Code 52-4-205(1) (d) and (e).

**Motion to enter executive session: J Baldwin, second – R Sneddon**

**Vote: Yea: K Allen, J Baldwin, J Drew, D Giles, R Sneddon**

**Nay: None**

**Abstained: None**

**Excused: None**

**Motion to close City Council meeting: J Baldwin, second – D Giles**

**Vote: Yea: K Allen, J Baldwin, J Drew, D Giles, R Sneddon**

**Nay: None**

**Abstained: None**

**Excused: None**

Meeting adjourned at 9:34 pm.

Minutes recorded and prepared by C Craven.



Don W. Calderwood, Chairman



Skarlet Bankhead, City Recorder





City Council Meeting

**April 12, 2016**

## Please Sign In

Name	City of Residence
Rowan Cecil	Providence
DALE TURNER	PROVIDENCE
Ralph Daniels	Providence
Vic Little	PARADISE
Alma & Pam Leonhardt	Providence
Darcy Pees	Providence
Bob Cruz	Providence
Monti Jones	Providence
Cindy O'Hara	Providence
Sandra Checketts	Providence
GARY KNIGHTON	PROVIDENCE
Clair Hibbard	Providence
Ralph Call	Providence
Nancy Stiles	"
Laura Fisher	"
George O. Hill	"
C-BRENT ARNELL	"
NAN ARNELL	"
James Mohr	"
Ned Miller	" "

City Council Meeting

**April 12, 2016**

## Please Sign In

[illegible]



City Council Meeting

April 12, 2016

Please Sign In

Name

City of Residence

Sharell Eames

Providence

# City Government Cost and Function Analysis for 14 Utah Cities

[RVS 4/12/2016]

City	Population	Chief Administrative Officer					Dir Public Works		Recorder	Treasurer	Court Clerk	Mayor	Council	City Salary & Benefits	Cost per Citizen
		Title (Enforce City Ord)	Salary	Appoint-Elect/Dismiss	Supervisor										
Smithfield	11,014	City Manager (NO)	\$110,274	Mayor + City C/ WOC	Mayor		\$81,257	\$95,896	\$53,798	\$48,537	\$8,858	\$5,368	\$425,460	39	
North Logan	9,874	City Admin-Eng (NO)	\$116,684	Mayor + City C/ WOC	Mayor (Ch 3-503)		\$105,657	\$61,931	\$59,063	0	\$19,972	\$5,982	\$393,217	40	
Providence	7,066	Mayor (YES)	0	Elected	---		\$95,424	\$89,861	\$31,160	\$49,890	\$6,459	\$3,791	\$291,749	41	
Salem	7,237	Mayor (YES)	0	Elected	---		\$138,938	\$104,080	\$80,162	0	0	0	\$323,180	45	
Nibley	6,172	City Manager-Rec (YES)	\$96,608	City Council/WOC	City Council		\$96,540	0	\$58,774	\$37,119	\$8,397	\$3,875	\$316,813	51	
Ivins	7,665	City Manager (YES)	\$161,771	Mayor + City C/WOC	City Council		\$128,773	\$80,878	0	0	\$15,781	\$8,713	\$430,768	56	
Richfield	7,518	City Admin (YES)	\$114,578	Mayor + City C/WOC	City Council		\$114,805	\$85,096	\$63,686	0	\$12,577	\$8,300	\$432,242	57	
Hyrum	7,818	City Admin (?)	\$119,555	Mayor + City C/ ?	City Council		\$107,149	\$81,610	\$73,711	\$24,203	\$14,309	\$5,167	\$446,372	57	
South Weber.	6,731	City Manager (YES)	\$121,774	City Council/WOC	City Council		\$109,988	\$53,987	\$58,365	\$35,661	\$10,586	\$3,952	\$410,121	61	
Fruit Heights	5,859	City Manager (NO)	\$116,348	Mayor + City C/ WOC	Mayor		\$95,299	\$58,973	\$58,840	0	\$9,234	\$4,947	\$363,429	62	
Santa Clara	6,671	City Manager (YES)	\$124,675	Mayor + City C/ WOC	City Council		\$129,513	\$64,228	\$59,231	\$6,667	\$9,199	\$4,994	\$418,483	63	
Hyde Park	4,274	Mayor (YES)	0	Elected	---		\$100,125	\$62,789	\$71,746	\$55,107	\$6,459	\$2,584	\$309,146	72	
Millville	1,918	Mayor (YES)	0	Elected	---		\$75,471	\$36,925	\$27,720	0	\$7,475	\$2,745	\$161,316	84	
Wellsville	3,578	City Manager/Rec (NO)	\$113,691	Mayor + City C/WOC	Mayor		\$90,460	\$66,971	\$51,179	\$45,742	\$6,867	\$2,130	\$385,560	108	

NOTES 1:

\* WOC - Without Cause

\*\* Providence Code Ch7 - Officers and Employees Section 1-7-5 Official Neglect and Misconduct

NOTES 2:

Salary costs for city manager in Providence

Salary = \$120,000

City Salary + Benefits = \$411,749

Cost per citizen = 58

SOURCES:

Public Employee Salaries [www.utahsright.com](http://www.utahsright.com)

Population of Utah Cities [www.utah-demographics.com](http://www.utah-demographics.com)

Utah City Codes online [www.lawlibguides.byu.edu](http://www.lawlibguides.byu.edu)

Other Utah City Codes Google - **City Name** Municipal Code